

## **Appendix 3**

**Literature Review: The Potential Ecological Effects of Mercury, Dioxins, Thallium and Cadmium on Bird Receptors and Otter**



## 1. Introduction

There is considerable public, scientific and regulatory concern over the possible adverse health effects of chronic exposure to trace levels of persistent organic pollutants and heavy metals. Persistent organic pollutants (POPs), including polychlorinated dibenzo para dioxins (PCDDs; dioxins) and polychlorinated dibenzofurans (PCDFs; furans), hexachlorobenzene (HCB), polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs), are directly toxic to human health, animals and plants. These bio-accumulative compounds are of particular concern because of their possible carcinogenic, immunological and reproductive effects, and their potential impact on human development. Eliminating POPs is therefore a key goal of environmental action at EU and international levels. The polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins (PCDDs) and furans (PCDFs) were unintentionally produced and released from a range of human activities.

This literature review forms part of the Appropriate assessment (AA) screening and Natura Impact Statement (NIS) for the proposed Ringaskiddy Resource Recovery Centre. It examines the potential ecological effects of key contaminants—mercury, dioxins (and furans), cadmium, and thallium—on sensitive wildlife species, specifically birds and otters, associated with the Cork Harbour Special Protection Area (SPA) and Great Island Channel Special Area of Conservation (SAC).

The review focuses on pollutants of concern that may arise from waste-to-energy (WtE) incineration, with particular attention to:

- Special conservation interests for Cork Harbour SPA,
- Other piscivorous species which could potentially use habitats in proximity to the site i.e. Otter
- Pollutant pathways relevant to aquatic and estuarine ecosystems,
- Scientific evidence of toxic effects from both historic and contemporary sources,
- The regulatory context and improvements in emission standards since the adoption of the EU Waste Incineration Directive (2000/76/EC) and subsequent Industrial Emissions Directive (2010/75/EU).

The review aims to assess whether the operation of the proposed facility could result in adverse effects on the integrity of the Natura 2000 sites, particularly through contaminant accumulation in the food web. The review assesses historical and contemporary scientific literature alongside Irish monitoring data, to determine the potential impact of waste-to-energy (WtE) emissions on Natura 2000 qualifying interests and supports a risk-based evaluation under the EU Habitats Directive.

A number of POPs are categorised below, but given the nature of these studies there is significant overlap in the studies.

## 2. History of dioxin and heavy metal emissions from incineration

Waste incineration has a long history in Europe, with the first dedicated waste incinerators dating back to 1876 in the UK (Bontoux 1999). In the past, many US cities had thousands of residential incinerators in the city without any air pollution controls. At one time New York City had an

estimated 18,000 residential incinerators and 32 municipal incinerators (Psomopoulos *et al.* 2009), the environmental impacts of which can still be detected in deep lying cores of the Central Park soil. Activities such as these have understandably left a lasting bad impression of waste incineration. During this time, when the effects of emissions on health and the environment were not well understood, all high temperature processes, including metal smelting, cement production, coal-fired power plants and incinerators, were the sources of enormous emissions to the atmosphere. In particular, incinerators were the major sources of toxic organic compounds (dioxins and furans) and heavy metals such as mercury. However, legislation on emissions over the last two decades has led to huge reductions in waste incineration emissions.

In 1989, for the first time the EU adopted legislation to reduce dioxin emissions from municipal waste incineration by setting up operational conditions. These Emission Limit Values (ELV) were set at Community level in the Waste Incineration Directive 2000/76/EC, leading to significant reductions in dioxin emissions. Modern incinerators have adopted advanced filtration systems (e.g., fabric filters, activated carbon injection) and improved combustion conditions, drastically reducing PCDD/F emissions. Emissions of dioxins and furans from waste incineration in the EU have decreased by over 90% since 1989 (EEA, 2019). Between 1990 and 2017, the European Environment Agency reported a steady decline in total PCDD/F emissions from all sources, with waste incineration emissions dropping significantly due to regulatory compliance and technological improvements (EEA, 2019).

Similar trends have been observed in the US. In 1995, the US EPA adopted new emissions standards for WtE facilities pursuant to the Clean Air Act. These regulations dictated that WtE facilities with large units (i.e., >227 tonnes per day) should comply with new Clean Air Act standards by December 2000. Ireland's EPA data indicates that dioxin emissions have decreased by over 90% since the mid-1990s, with sources like waste incinerators, medical waste incinerators, and industrial processes showing steep declines (EPA, 2021).

It is noted that the quantity of municipal waste incinerated in the EU grew by 11% between 2010 and 2022 (from 53 to 56 million tonnes). In the period since data are available: municipal waste incineration grew 96% between 1995 and 2022 (from 30 to 59 million tonnes in 2022 (Eurostat, 2024)). Changes in the emission to air of different pollutants by EU incineration facilities varied between 2010 and 2022, showing either increasing or decreasing trends (EEA). However, a more stable path has emerged since 2017. This may be attributed to these plants beginning to adapt to the best available techniques (BAT) described in their specific sectoral BAT reference documents (BREF). In addition, BAT provisions entered into force for waste incineration plants from late 2023. Therefore, emissions figures from incineration plants are expected to decline after the full implementation of their BAT conclusions (the legally-binding section of the BREF). The revised Industrial Emissions Directive (IED) adopted in 2024 will help reduce emissions further (EU, 2024).

Persistent organic pollutants (POPs) bioaccumulate and harm human health. Targeted EU legislation, in line with commitments under the UNECE Air Convention, led to marked POP reductions from 1990. In recent years (2005-2022), emissions have continued to fall, with declines reported in most Member States: hexachlorobenzene by 56%, polychlorinated biphenyls by 61%, dioxins and furans by 66%, and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons by 22%. The most significant POP sources are the commercial, institutional and households and industrial processes and product use sectors.

The Stockholm Convention (2004) on Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs) aimed to eliminate or restrict the production and use of intentionally produced POPs, and also to minimize and ultimately eliminate the release of unintentionally produced POPs like dioxins and furans. In 2009, the Aarhus Protocol and the Stockholm Convention were amended to cover additional compounds and introduce emission limit values for waste incineration. Moreover, in 2016, the EU's National Emissions reduction Commitments Directive (NECD) was amended to include new reporting requirements for Member States, including the requirement to provide annual inventories of POP emissions.

Between 2005 and 2022, emissions of dioxins and furans, HCB, PCBs and PAHs decreased by 66%, 56%, 61% and 22%, respectively, with notable declines in the industrial processes and product use, energy production and distribution, and waste sectors. Yet, the industrial processes and product use sector remains a significant source of POPs, accounting for 77% of PCBs, and almost 9% of dioxins and furans as well as 26% of HCB emissions in 2022. The commercial, institutional and household sector is also a significant source of POPs, accounting for 81% of PAH, 20% of dioxins and furans, and 17% of HCB emissions in 2022. In addition, the agricultural sector accounted for 20% of HCB emissions in 2022.

According to the EPA (2018) publication the main sources for emissions of dioxins to air in EU-25 are from non-industrial sources, with approximately 30% of emissions across the EU-25 from residential combustion, with 15% from backyard burning.

Since 1995, the Irish EPA have regularly monitored dioxin levels in cow's milk. The primary mechanism for dioxins entering the food chain is through atmospheric deposition. Therefore cow's milk is seen as a suitable means of assessing the presence of dioxins in the environment, since cows tend to graze over relatively large areas and these compounds will, if present, concentrate in the fat content of the milk. Levels of dioxins in cow's milk have been consistently low since the surveys began. According to Ireland's EPA (2021) the main source of dioxins is illegal burning of waste. Dioxin concentrations, as in recent years, were well below European limit values i.e. 2.5pg WHO TEQ/g for dioxins only, and 5.5pg WHO TEQ/ g for dioxins and PCBs combined (Concannon, 2014). The EPA results are in line with results from Cork County Council's animal health surveillance programme, which has been operating in the Cork Harbour Region since 1991 (Buckley *et al.*, 2013). The Cork Harbour report found dioxin, furan and PCB levels were significantly less than the applicable limits. This study, which began in 2005 and is still ongoing, found dioxins and furan levels remained generally stable at values considered as low background levels in European terms. No recent results have been published.

### **3. Dioxins and Furans**

#### **3.1 Impact of dioxins on wildlife**

After the Second World War, scientists began to recognise that certain chemical pollutants were capable of persisting in the environment for long time, migrating in air, water, soil and sediments and accumulating to levels that could harm wildlife and human health. These chemical pollutants were labelled persistent organic pollutants (POPs) (Manahan 2000). Because they can be transported by wind and water, most POPs generated in one country can and do affect people and wildlife far from where they are used and released. They persist for long periods of time in the environment and can accumulate and pass from one species to the next through the food chain. Many POPs were widely used during the boom in industrial production after World War II, when thousands of synthetic chemicals were introduced into commercial use. Many of these chemicals

proved beneficial in pest and disease control, crop production, and industry. These same chemicals, however, have had unforeseen effects on human health and the environment. POP's include Polychlorinated Biphenyls (PCBs), DDT and dioxins. While some POPs are intentionally produced for pest control (e.g. DDT) or for industrial processes (PCBs), others are unintentional by-products of industrial processes or combustion (e.g. dioxins and furans).

"Dioxins" is a collective term for the category of 75 polychlorinated dibenzo-para-dioxin compounds (PCDDs) and 135 polychlorinated dibenzofuran compounds (PCDFs). Seventeen PCDD and PCDF compounds are considered to be of toxicological significance. The most toxic of these is 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (2,3,7,8TCDD). PCDDs and PCDFs enter the environment as by-products of industrial processes such as the combustion of chlorine-containing waste, especially plastics, wood burning and other combustion, metal production and, more historically, manufacturing of chlorophenol-based biocides and chlorine bleach pulping of wood (de March *et al.*, 1998). The toxic responses include skin effects, immunotoxicity and carcinogenicity, as well as reproductive and developmental toxicity. These compounds, or congeners, arise mainly as unintentional bi-products of incomplete or poorly controlled combustion and from certain chemical processes.

In animal studies, TCDD and dioxin-like chemicals demonstrate many effects including: altered transcription of genes; induction of various enzymes; wasting syndrome; hepatotoxicity; altered immune function; testicular atrophy; altered thyroid function; chloracne; porphyria; neurotoxicity; teratogenicity; and carcinogenicity (EPA, 2004). Laboratory studies on birds have shown a variety of effects from dioxins including lethality, chick oedema, decreased growth rates (Hoffman *et al.* 1996) decreases in locomotory responses, deficits in body motions and balance, aggressive behaviour (Dahlgren and Linder 1974, Kreitzer and Heinz 1974) and changes in brain neurotransmitters (Sharma *et al.* 1976). Fish eating birds which inhabit areas contaminated with TCDD are chronically exposed during embryonic development via the yolk and this has anti-oestrogenic effects (Janz and Bellward 1996). *In ovo* exposure to these compounds during the perinatal period may also be responsible for certain behavioural characteristics and reproductive dysfunction.

Hart *et al.* (1991) examined the relationship between concentrations of PCDDs and PCDFs in Great Blue Heron (*Ardea herodias*) eggs and the effects on chicks. Eggs were collected from sites of low, intermediate and high contamination. Levels of TCDD in eggs were 10 ng/kg (wet weight), 135 ng/kg and 211 ng/kg, respectively. There was little difference in mortality of chicks from eggs collected from the various sites, suggesting no effect on survival at levels of PCDD/PCDFs seen in the eggs. Effects of contamination included decreased growth with increased TCDD level, depression of skeletal growth with increased TCDD levels and subcutaneous oedema which increased with increasing PCDD and PCDF contamination. Also observed were shortened beaks and a scarcity of down follicles in the chicks from the more contaminated sites.

Uptake of PCDD and PCDF in laying ducks was determined at different degrees of feed contamination (Shun-I Shih *et al.* 2009). To observe the extent of the transfer of 17 PCDD/Fs from feed to the duck eggs and duck meat, 18 ducks were divided into three groups (six in each group) and fed feed with two different levels of PCDD/Fs. As a control, one group of ducks was fed with the non-contaminated feed for comparison, while the other two groups were exposed to the feed mixed with fly ash. The experiment lasted for 60 days, with an exposure duration of 41 days and the subsequent noncontaminated feed being given for an additional 19 days. PCDD/F levels in the eggs of the all three groups were observed to increase significantly on the 15th day.

For the low contaminated group, PCDD/F levels reached 2.61pg WHO-TEQ/g lipid at day 41, whereas those of the high contaminated group accounted exceeded 3pg/g lipid on the 15th day. Furthermore, PCDD/Fs levels in the duck meat were analysed before and after exposure duration, and at the end of the experiment. The results showed that the level of PCDD/F in the duck eggs and the duck meat may reach unacceptable levels due to the effect of accumulation, although the PCDD/Fs in the duck feed were at acceptable levels.

### 3.2 Dioxins in birds and incineration

A number of studies have attempted to examine the direct links between dioxin contaminated sites and morbidity effects in birds occupying adjacent habitats. Rumbold *et al.* (1997) examined levels of TCDD, tetrachlorodibenzofuran (TCDF) and selected metal concentrations in eggs and nestlings of Anhingas (*Anhinga anhinga*) and White Ibises (*Eudocimus albus*) collected from a colony next to a Florida municipal solid-waste (MSW) combustor and ash landfill. Most of the measured residues, including TCDD, TCDF, arsenic, beryllium, cadmium and nickel, remained at pre-operational levels during the first five years of facility operation. Selenium (in Anhingas) and mercury (in both Anhingas and Ibises) occurred at their lowest concentrations in samples collected during the fifth year of facility operation (Year-5). Concentrations of lead in Ibis nestlings were highest in Year-1 and Year-5 compared to Year-0. The MSW combustor could neither be ruled out nor confirmed as the source of this lead. In a follow on study at the same facility Rumbold and Mihalik (2002) found that concentrations of most residues, including TCDD, TCDF, arsenic, beryllium, cadmium and lead, were at levels comparable to those found during previous survey prior to facility start-up. Nickel residues were detected only sporadically in Anhingas and in eggs from Ibises, and decreased significantly in concentration in Ibis nestlings in 1999 compared to 1989. While concentrations of mercury in Anhinga nestlings and in eggs of both species were comparable to 1989 levels, its concentration was significantly greater in Ibis nestlings in 1999. However, levels of mercury in the Ibises remained relatively low when compared to birds from other areas of Florida and did not appear to represent a health threat. While lead did not increase in 1999, its concentration in Ibis nestlings remained a concern. The most notable temporal trend observed in birds at this site was a general monotonic decrease in levels of selenium residues during the 10-year monitoring period.

In 1991, eggs of the Common Tern (*Sterna hirundo*) were collected at eight different locations and incubated artificially (Bosveld *et al.* 1995). The toxicity of a mixture of dioxins and dioxin-like compounds can be expressed in a single number - the toxic equivalency (TEQ) and this was used as a metric to examine the residual yolk sacs of the hatchlings. Highly polluted colonies, located in the main sedimentation area of the Rhine and Meuse rivers, contained on average 16ng TEQ per gram lipid, which was fivefold higher than the concentrations in the reference colony. The hepatic EROD activity (a highly sensitive indicator of contaminant uptake) was induced fourfold compared to the reference colony ( $p < 0.005$ ). At the individual level, a significant relationship was found between log TEQ and EROD levels. Average TEQ concentration in chicks that hatched after 23 d of incubation were twice the concentration of those that hatched after 21 d ( $p < 0.05$ ). No concentration-related effects on morphology and physiology were found. The non-ortho- and mono-ortho-PCBs were predominant regarding the total TEQ, while the PCDDs and PCDFs contributed less than 10%. The PCB patterns were highly similar among the individual birds and among different locations. In contrast, PCDD and PCDF patterns were not similar at all locations, and two distinct patterns could be recognised and related to sediments that were deposited during different time periods.

Naito and Murato (2009) carried out a population-level assessment of the ecological risks of dioxin-like PCB exposure to piscivorous birds in Tokyo Bay, Japan. Egg mortality risk and changes in the population growth rate in relation to the contamination levels of dioxin-like PCBs in eggs of Grey Heron (*Ardea cinerea*), Great Cormorant (*Phalacrocorax carbo*), Osprey (*Pandion haliaetus*), and Kingfisher (*Alcedo atthis*) were determined by integrating the results of exposure analysis, effect analysis, and a life-history model for each species. The results concluded that the levels of dioxin-like PCBs observed in the Tokyo Bay area alone would not have significant population-level effects on the fish-eating bird populations. This study follows a 95% reduction in Japanese incinerator dioxin emissions between 1997 and 2003 (Yoshida *et al.* 2009).

North America's Great Lakes are the world's largest inland source of freshwater, supporting tens of millions of people and large wildlife populations. In the 1970s, scientists raised the alarm over severe industrial contamination of their waters. Since that time, some of the most recognized and pervasive compounds (e.g., PCBs) have declined exponentially - only to level off since the 1990s (de Solla *et al.*, 2016). Reduced contamination has led to a current “Good” status for the Great Lakes (Environment and Climate Change Canada and the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2017). The area around the Great Lakes in the US and Canada is heavily industrialised and has a significant number of MSW (54 incinerators) and medical waste (14 incinerators) (data from 1996).

Following the discovery of widespread adverse reproductive effects in fish-eating colonial waterbirds nesting in the Canadian Great Lakes, Environment Canada started monitoring contaminants in Herring Gull (*Larus argentatus*) eggs in 1974 (de Solla *et al.* 2016). This study looked at current (from 2016) and historical concentrations and rates of decline of legacy contaminants (Polychlorinated Biphenyls [PCBs], 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin [TCDD] and organochlorine pesticides) in Herring Gull eggs from 15 Great Lakes colonies over 40 years. Large declines in contaminant concentrations were found in all colonies from the first year of reporting to 2013. First-order exponential decay regressions indicated that rates of decline in eggs varied among compounds. Exponential rates of decline in Herring Gulls mirrored those previously reported for Great Lakes fish.

In a more recent study, Hammon *et al* (2024) combined Canadian and American dataset of Herring Gull egg data to elucidate trends in wildlife for eight legacy industrial pollutants and insecticides in the Great Lakes (PCBs, total DDT, Dieldrin, Mirex, chlordane congeners, heptachlor epoxide (HE), TEQs of dioxins/furans and octachlorostyrene (OCS)). Environmental quality of the Great Lakes region (as indexed by WEQI) improved by 18% between 2002 and 2017. Improvement came from reductions in both the scope of contamination (the number of guideline-exceeding contaminants) and its amplitude (the average size of guideline exceedances) at bird colonies. But recovery was unequal among lakes, with Lake Erie showing no improvement at one extreme. Weakly- or non-recovering lakes (Erie, Ontario, Huron) were marked by inconsistent improvement in scope and amplitude, likely due to ongoing loading, sediment resuspension and other stressors reported elsewhere. Fast-recovering lakes (Superior and Michigan), meanwhile, improved in both scope and amplitude. Contrasting trends and contaminant profiles (e.g., exceedances of PCBs versus DDTs) highlight the importance of lake-specific management for equalizing recoveries. Lower environmental quality at American than Canadian colonies, particularly in Lake Huron, further suggest uneven success in – and opportunities for – the binational management of wildlife exposure to legacy contaminants.



Grasman et al (2025) examined immunological, reproductive, and population endpoints for fish-eating birds. This US study examined datasets from 2010–2019 in the Saginaw River and Bay and River Raisin Areas of Concern (AOCs) and Grand Traverse Bay, which are ecosystems historically contaminated with polychlorinated biphenyls, dibenzo-p-dioxins, and dibenzofurans. Reference sites were in the lower St. Marys River (herring gulls and Caspian terns), eastern Lake Superior (terns), and eastern Lake Huron (black-crowned night herons). Relative risk ratios for embryonic nonviability (from both infertility and mortality) in gull embryos were 2–3-fold higher than the reference site in both AOCs and Grand Traverse Bay. Twelve of 13 deformed embryos and chicks (e.g., crossed bills and gastroschisis) were observed at the contaminated sites. Productivity of 4-week-old tern chicks in Saginaw Bay was 35% lower than that at reference sites. In the River Raisin AOC, productivity of 4-week gull chicks was poor in 7 of 10 years. Numbers of breeding herring gulls decreased significantly in the River Raisin AOC, and breeding Caspian terns, a state-threatened species, declined in the Saginaw River and Bay AOC. The mean T cell-dependent phytohemagglutinin skin response was suppressed 50%–56% in gull chicks in both AOCs and Grand Traverse Bay, and 49% in terns and 33% in herons in Saginaw Bay. Antibody responses in gull chicks in the River Raisin AOC and Grand Traverse Bay were 1.6–2-fold lower than reference. Time trend analyses showed no significant improvements in reproductive and immune endpoints in either AOC or Grand Traverse Bay over the study period. Embryonic death increased with time in gulls in the lower Saginaw Bay, and antibody responses decreased in terns in the outer Saginaw Bay.

Braune et al (2017) determined congener patterns and temporal trends for PCDDs, PCDFs, nPCBs as well as their toxic equivalents (TEQs) in eggs of thick-billed murres (*Uria lomvia*) and northern fulmars (*Fulmarus glacialis*) sampled from Prince Leopold Island in the Canadian Arctic between 1975 and 2014. The dominant PCDD congeners were 1,2,3,7,8-PnCDD, 2,3,7,8-TCDD and 1,2,3,6,7,8-HxCDD, and the dominant PCDF congener was 2,3,4,7,8-PnCDF. The nPCB profile was dominated by PCB-126. The TEQ profile in the murre eggs was dominated by nPCB-TEQ whereas in the fulmar eggs, the PCDF-TEQ contribution to  $\Sigma$ TEQ was slightly greater than that of nPCB-TEQ. Concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PCDD,  $\Sigma$ PCDF,  $\Sigma$ nPCB and  $\Sigma$ TEQ declined between 1975 and 2014 in both murre and fulmar eggs. Based on TEQ thresholds in the literature for other species, and taking into account the trend towards declining TEQ levels, it is unlikely that current levels of PCDDs, PCDFs or nPCBs are affecting the reproductive success of thick-billed murres or northern fulmars in the Canadian Arctic.

## 4. Heavy metals

### 4.1 Impacts of mercury in ecosystems

Mercury is a well-studied environmental contaminant, with wide-ranging impacts on the health of various taxa (Scheuhammer *et al.* 2007). Because mercury can be methylated and therefore become bioavailable in aquatic systems, it has historically been considered a problem for species directly associated with aquatic ecosystems, such as piscivorous birds (Wolfe *et al.* 1998).

There is a huge scientific literature on the distribution of mercury in ecosystems. Mercury has been measured in aquatic and terrestrial invertebrates, in a variety of plants, and in many higher organisms including humans. High concentrations of mercury have been associated with developmental and behavioral abnormalities, impaired reproduction and survival, and in some cases with direct mortality.

During the decades when seed grains were treated with organo-mercurial fungicides, huge numbers of wild birds were poisoned fatally with mercury. In the 1970s, declining use of organo-mercurial fungicides greatly reduced the severity of mercury exposure. However, mercury residues either through natural or anthropogenic sources remain. Several reports of mercury concentrations in avian species have been published in the peer-reviewed literature (Bowerman *et al.* 1994; Spalding *et al.* 1994; Langlois and Langis 1995). Based on historical and recent information, mercury is a common contaminant of avian tissues from diverse geographic locations. The feeding habits of particular avian species have been major predictors of risk of mercury toxicity. When seed grains were treated with organo-mercurial fungicides, herbivorous, omnivorous, and carnivorous species were all at risk of mercury toxicity. Because of the biomagnification of methylmercury in the aquatic foodweb, birds which feed on fish, crayfish or shellfish now have higher exposures to methylmercury than do non-fish eating birds. Birds, such as Grey Heron, that consume large fish as their prey, are predicted to be at greater risk of methylmercury poisoning than birds that consume smaller fish (Spalding *et al.* 1994; Sundlof *et al.* 1994). When the quantities of fish consumed on a body weight basis is also considered for smaller birds such as the Kingfisher, there is an elevated risk of methylmercury poisoning. Senthilkumar *et al.* (2002) found that as well as feeding habits, specific elimination and metabolism influenced differing contamination patterns between species.

Several estimates exist on mercury concentrations in soft tissues (liver, kidney, brain) that are associated with mercury poisoning in bird species. Experimental studies of survival and reproductive success of Black Ducks (*Anas rubripes*) indicated that adult ducks would tolerate liver mercury concentrations of 23 ppm and appear in good health (Findley and Stendell 1978). However, it was found that although the Black Ducks fed methylmercury in their diet appeared in good health, they had impaired reproductive success as indicated by reduced hatchability of eggs and high duckling mortality. Findley *et al.* (1979) concluded that concentrations of mercury in excess of 20 µg/g fresh weight in soft tissues should be considered extremely hazardous to avian species. Schuehammer (1991) indicated that the major effects of methylmercury in avian species were neurological, developmental and reproductive. The neurological changes included weakness, walking or flying difficulties and incoordination that were associated with brain mercury concentrations of 15 µg/g (fresh weight), or liver or kidney mercury concentrations of 30 µg/g (fresh weight). Schuehammer (1991) observed that significant reproductive impairment due to methylmercury occurred at about one-fifth the tissue concentrations required to produce overt neurotoxicity. Liver mercury concentrations of 2 to 12 µg/g (fresh weight) in adult breeding Pheasants (*Phasianus colchicus*) and Mallard (*Anas platyrhynchos*) were linked to decreased hatchability of eggs (Schuehammer 1991). Barr (1986) noted that clinical signs of mercury poisoning, such as impaired vision and ataxia in loons. Barr (1986) also noted that impairment of vision or ataxia in a visual hunter such as loon would be likely to reduce its chances of procuring adequate food and defending a territory.

Mercury concentrations in the livers of wading birds in Southern Florida (Sundlof *et al.* 1994; Spalding *et al.* 1994) and the merganser in northern Quebec (Langlois and Langis 1995) are in the range associated with adverse reproductive and neurological effects in other species of birds. Sundlof *et al.* (1994) reported that four Great Blue Heron collected from the central Everglades contained liver mercury at concentrations typically associated with overt neurological signs (>30 µg mercury/g fresh weight). Furthermore, these investigators found between 30% and 80% of the potential breeding-age birds collected in an area encompassing the central Everglades contained liver mercury at concentrations associated with reproductive impairment in ducks and Pheasants. In a parallel study, Spalding *et al.* (1994) determined the magnitude of mercury contamination associated with death of Great White Herons (*Ardea herodias occidentalis*). Birds that died of acute causes (e.g., trauma from collision with power lines or vehicles) had much lower liver

mercury concentrations (geometric mean 1.8 µg/g fresh weight, range 0.6 to 4.0 µg/g fresh weight) than did birds that died of chronic diseases (geometric mean 9.8 µg/g fresh weight, range 2.9 to 59.4 µg/g fresh weight).

Dietary methylmercury reduces the appetite and growth rates of baby birds. In the baby birds fed methylmercury (Spalding *et al.* 2000a) at 0.5 mg/kg body weight (comparable to doses encountered in the wild) anemia, feather abnormalities, neurological changes, and immunology damage occurred. At higher doses birds showed gait disturbances. Birds in the wild died at lower doses than laboratory birds, presumably due to multiple stressors (Spalding *et al.* 2000b).

Although the hazards of environmental mercury were already well recognized by 1970, there was considerable speculation regarding the relative contribution of anthropogenic versus natural sources. Hammond (1971) questioned whether the magnitude of human releases was sufficient to alter the concentration of mercury in the marine ecosystem. Thompson *et al.* (1998) addressed this question by showing that the mercury content of seabird feathers had increased between 65% and 394% (or 1-4% per year) in five species of North Atlantic seabirds for which pre-1931 and post-1979 feather samples were available. Based on mercury levels in the feathers of museum specimens, mercury levels in carnivorous birds in Europe were low prior to the mid-20th century and then increased, reflecting the increased anthropogenic (both industrial and agricultural) contribution to the environment. Odsjö (1975) documented the dramatic jump in mercury concentration of Scandinavian Goshawk (*Accipiter gentilis*) feathers from < 5 µg/g prior to 1940 to about 20 µg/g after 1940. Peregrine Falcons (*Falco peregrinus*) averaged less than 3 µg/g prior to 1940, jumping to almost 38 µg/g (1964-1966) and declining to 7-17 µg/g in the 1970s (Lindberg and Odsjö 1983) as agricultural uses and industrial pollution were curtailed. Smaller differences occur in non-predatory species, such as the Bartailed Godwit (*Limosa lapponica*) in the Netherlands where values increased from 0.4 µg/g (1904-1963) up to 2.0-4.9 µg/g (1979-1982).

Monteiro *et al.* (1999) examined mercury concentrations in egg and plumage samples of adults and chicks of seabirds from colonies in the Portuguese Atlantic. Species and tissues were selected to ensure varied levels of ecological (epipelagic vs mesopelagic), spatial (coastal vs pelagic) and temporal (short-to medium-term) integration of mercury contamination. Results show a four-fold increase in mercury bioaccumulation from the epipelagic to the mesopelagic areas. Such background uniformity of mercury contamination in the North Atlantic conveys further evidence of global pollution by mercury due to atmospheric deposition at long distance from emission sources.

In a recent study, Ma *et al.* (2022) found 93 relevant articles which examined pollutant contamination in ~37% (79 of 215) of all shorebird species, mostly from the Charadriidae and Scolopacidae families. Studies were geographically biased: the majority were conducted in American flyways, while only one was found from Australasia and few were conducted in Asian flyways. The main geographic gap for research includes East Africa, South Asia and Siberian Arctic. The most well-documented pollutants included mercury (Hg, 37 studies), cadmium (33), and lead (Pb, 28); less well studied pollutants were barium (1), calcium (1), strontium (1), dicofols (1), and other newly emerging contaminants, such as plastic debris/microplastics (4) and antibiotics resistance (2). Several pollutants have caused considerable concerns in shorebirds, including embryotoxicity caused by PCBs at non-optimum temperature (laboratory experiments); reduced reproduction performance linked to maternal Hg and paternal Pb (field evidence); and

reduced re-fueling and flight performance related to oil contamination (both field and laboratory evidence).

## 4.2 Waste incineration and mercury in birds

The Everglades (Florida US system) was historically highly contaminated with mercury, which had been linked to local waste incineration (Dvonch *et al.* 1999, Frederick, 2000). Elevated methylmercury concentrations were recorded in many species of wetland wildlife and have been extensively studied in Great Egrets (*Egretta alba*), one of the top trophic level piscivorous species.

The implementation of the Clean Air Act in 2000 led to significant decreases in local mercury inputs and Lange *et al.* (2000), found that the mercury levels in Everglades Egrets declined rapidly. Frederick *et al.* (2002) examined mercury contamination in piscivorous birds over six years in the Everglades. Species examined included Great Egret and White Ibises. Over the course of the study, Everglades' colonies maintained their mercury concentration rankings relative to one another, but all showed strongly declining mercury concentrations (mean of 73% averaged across colonies, between 1994 and 2000). The study concluded that the Everglades has undergone a biologically significant decline in mercury availability in the wetland food web, possibly because of decreased local inputs.

Herring *et al.* (2008) attempted to link mercury contamination in the Florida Everglades with declines in the numbers of wading birds. Feather mercury levels in Great Egret and White Ibis nestlings were assessed. Nestlings were in better physiological condition when feather mercury levels were higher. These results support the hypothesis that nestlings are protected from the harmful effects of mercury through deposition of mercury in growing feathers. The study also found evidence to suggest shifts in diets of the two species, as a function of prey availability, thus altering their exposure profiles. However, no evidence was found to suggest that birds responded differently to mercury exposure.

However, temporal patterns of mercury are complex. Over the course of 11 years (2008–2018), Janssen *et al.* (2022) found no consistent declines were observed in precipitation, water, or fish Hg concentrations in the Everglades despite measurable declines in national atmospheric emissions of Hg (NEI, 2017), likely reflecting that atmospheric Hg delivered to the Florida peninsula is predominantly derived from global sources. Furthermore, this work demonstrates the regionality of FMeHg and BMeHg “hotspots” within the Everglades, which are closely tied to the delivery of aromatic DOC and sulfate to the northern boundary of ENP from upgradient drainage canals. The delivery of agricultural runoff to the SRS, which has remained largely unchanged for the past 20 years (Varonka *et al.*, 2020), is interpreted to enhance the formation of FMeHg, resulting in subsequent bioaccumulation and 2–3× higher fish MeHg concentrations compared to the surrounding marsh.

## 4.3 Other Heavy Metals

Cadmium (Cd) occurs in association with zinc and is found in soils, mud, humus and organic matter. It is a significant anthropogenic contaminant, but soils derived from carboniferous black shales may contain up to 200 ppm. Major environmental sources of cadmium include electroplating, zinc and lead mining and smelting, paint and pigments, batteries, plastics, coal-fired power plants, and municipal wastewater and sewage sludge. Cadmium is a known teratogen

and affects calcium metabolism causing excess calcium excretion, which negatively impacts both skeletal and cardiovascular systems (Eisler 1985). In addition, growth retardation, anemia, and testicular damage occur in cadmium-exposed wildlife (Eisler 1985). Cadmium is readily bio-accumulated and available data suggests that it is biomagnified through food chains (Larison *et al.* 2000). Cadmium is readily taken up from the soil (especially by leafy plants and under acid pH) but, although the initial rate of uptake can be linear relative to soil concentration, it tends to tail off with time (Vernet, 1992). Cadmium is relatively mobile and shows potential for accumulation through the lower terrestrial trophic levels, although leaf crops are more problematic than root or seed crops from a human perspective (Lepp 1981). It accumulates in the soft tissues of grazing animals where it is highly toxic, with pasture herbs being a more dangerous pathway of transmission than grasses. White-tailed ptarmigan (*Lagopus leucura*) in Colorado are at threat from cadmium poisoning due to bio-magnification in willow (*Salix* spp.), a primary food plant for these birds (Larison *et al.* 2000). Cadmium residues in vertebrate kidney or liver that are >10 ppm fresh weight or 2 ppm whole body fresh weight should be viewed as evidence of probable cadmium toxicity; residues of 200 ppm kidney (fresh weight), or >5 ppm whole animal fresh weight are indicative of cadmium poisoning. Wildlife, especially migratory birds, which feed on crops growing in fields fertilized with municipal sewage sludge, may be at considerable risk from cadmium toxicity (Eisler 1985).

Thallium pollution is far less documented than other toxic metals as reliable measurements are difficult at such low concentrations, Cement production originally was estimated to be the primary source of thallium pollution at the global scale, but it was later recognized that coal burning was likely the main source. These previous estimates refer to the recent decades but no longer-term inventories were available. Furthermore, no inventories were established at the scale of the European continent. Detailed measurements in Alpine ice cores show that thallium pollution after the late 19th century primarily was the result of coal burning in western Europe, and was largest between 1920 and 1965 as expected from coal consumption records. The rapid growth of cement production that took place after World War II had only limited impact on thallium pollution in Europe.

Thallium (Th) is often chemically associated with arsenic, and may also be concentrated in soils derived from weathered limestone (Lepp 1981). The main anthropogenic source is flue gases, primarily from coal burning, non-ferrous smelting and cement production (Alloway 1995, Nriagu 1998). In this context, the contribution from MSW incineration seems negligible, but this may be understated since MSW and industrial wastes have been used to fuel cement kilns in France since 1986 (Porteus 1996). The forms of thallium found in flue gas are fairly soluble and affect both plants and animals (enzyme inhibitor), the toxicity to animals possibly being enhanced by microbial biomethylation (Lepp 1981). Although soil/plant exchange increases at acid pH, thallium mobility in the aquatic environment is largely independent of major water characteristics such as hardness. Aquatic food-source invertebrates such as *Daphnia* are affected at levels below the vertebrate toxicity threshold and therefore have indirect effects upon fish stocks (Nriagu 1998).

Cadmium may arise in air emissions of MSW incinerators due to its thermal mobility. Although some countries restrict applications of Cd, frequent sources in MSW incinerators are electronic devices (including accumulators), paints, Ni-Cd batteries, and cadmium-stabilised plastics. Under the conditions usually observed in the furnace, Cd is mainly converted into CdCl<sub>2</sub> (Quina *et al.* 2011). The air pollution control (APC) devices normally lead to a concentration of Cd in APC residues, and less than 1% is released to the atmosphere. The reported range is usually 0.0002-0.03 mg/Nm<sup>3</sup> (11% of O<sub>2</sub>) (BREF, 2006). The thallium amount in municipal solid waste is

virtually non-existent and very often below any detection limit (Quina *et al.* 2011). Studies in Japan (Ono 2012) revealed that the emissions of Cadmium peaked in 1973 (11.1 t) and were ten times those in 2010 (1.2 t). Emission from MSWIs was two-thirds of that from non-ferrous smelting in 2010. The main Cd emission source was pigment use in the 1970s, but after 2000 it had shifted to nickel-cadmium (Ni-Cd) batteries. Future emissions were estimated for 2030. Compared to the business-as-usual scenario, an intensive collection of used Ni-Cd batteries and a ban on any future use of Ni-Cd batteries will reduce emissions by 0.09 and 0.31 t, respectively, in 2030. This approach enables us to identify the major Cd emission source from MSWIs, and to prioritize the possible Cd control policies.

## 5. Mammals

Piscivorous mammalian wildlife, such as Otter and Mink, are exposed to mercury in the same way as piscivorous birds i.e. via the consumption of contaminated fish. Concentrations of mercury in wildlife have been observed at concentrations causing adverse effects in laboratory studies using the same species (U.S. EPA 1997). Toxic effects from the consumption of contaminated fish have been observed in mammalian wildlife in areas with point sources of mercury emission (U.S. EPA 1997). The U.S. EPA (1997) investigated population impacts on piscivorous wildlife and estimated an adverse effect level for methylmercury in trophic level 3 fish (between 0.077 and 0.3 µg/g). This indicates that it is possible that individuals of some highly exposed wildlife subpopulations are experiencing adverse toxic effects due to mercury in the food chain. In a study of Mink and Otter, the U.S. EPA (1997) concluded that field data were insufficient to determine whether these species suffered adverse effects.

Zwiernik *et al.* (2008) examined dioxin and furan levels in Mink at Tittabawassee River, Michigan, U.S. where sediments have been historically contaminated with dioxins, furans and PCBs. Significant concentrations of PCDF's and PCDD's have been recorded within the sediments, and the area is a major industrial and population centre along the river. However, the resident mink survey, including number of mink present, morphological measures, sex ratios, population age structure, and gross and histological tissue examination, indicated no observable adverse effects. Based on the lack of negative outcomes for any measurement endpoints examined in the study and direct measures of effects on individual mink and their population it was concluded that these high concentrations of PCDDs/PCDFs were not causing adverse effects on resident mink of the Tittabawassee River.

Otters are consistently fish eaters whose diet consist of at least 95% fish (Toweill and Tabor, 1982). Mercury concentrations in Otter tissues have been positively associated with mercury levels in prey (for example; fish, shellfish, crayfish) (Wren and Stokes, 1986; Foley *et al.* 1988; Langlois and Langis, 1995). Otter accumulated about ten times more mercury on a concentration basis than did predatory fishes from the same drainage areas (Kucera, 1983). These correlations were statistically significant (Foley *et al.* 1988) on the basis of mercury in the watershed because of the importance of fish, shellfish and crayfish in the diet of Otter. Case reports of clinical mercury poisoning exist for wild Otter (Wren, 1985). The magnitude of the concentration in one organ for Otter (for example, liver) is highly correlated with other organs (for example, kidney or brain) (Wren and Stokes 1986). The range of concentrations reported in different geographic locations is substantial. Consequently, broad generalisations are difficult regarding how close liver mercury concentrations of wildlife are to liver mercury concentrations of experimentally poisoned Mink. However, the upper range of liver mercury concentrations of Mink from northern Quebec (Langlois and Langis, 1995), Otters from Georgia (Hallbrook *et al.*, 1994) and Otters from Ontario (Wren *et al.* 1986) approximate those of clinically poisoned animals.

Lethal effects of mercury have also been recorded in the wild. Sleeman *et al.* (2010) reported a moribund 5-year-old female northern river otter (*Lontra canadensis*) was found on the bank of a river known to be extensively contaminated with mercury. It exhibited severe ataxia and scleral injection, made no attempt to flee, and died shortly thereafter of drowning. Tissue mercury levels were among the highest ever reported for a free-living terrestrial mammal: kidney, 353 µg/g; liver, 221 µg/g; muscle, 121 µg/g; brain (three replicates from cerebellum), 142, 151, 151 µg/g (all dry weights); and fur, 183 µg/g (fresh weight). Histopathologic findings including severe, diffuse, chronic glomerulosclerosis and moderate interstitial fibrosis were the presumptive cause of clinical signs and death. This is one of a few reports to document the death of a free-living mammal from presumed mercury poisoning.

Sub-lethal effects can be projected to be more wide-spread with additional reports showing average liver mercury concentrations approximately one-third of those in moribund mink with experimental methylmercury poisoning. Liver mercury concentrations of river otters from the lower coastal plain in Georgia averaged 7.5 µg/g (Hallbrook *et al.* 1994); this is approximately 33% of the concentrations associated with severe intoxication and/or death in a closely related species, the Mink (Wobeser *et al.* 1976a,b). In many geographic regions [e.g. Georgia (Hallbrook *et al.* 1994), New York State (Foley *et al.* 1988)], mercury concentrations in Mink and Otter tissues are 10-30% of the concentrations associated with severe, clinically evident methylmercury poisoning in Mink. For example, data showing Mink liver mercury concentrations averaging 2 µg/g or higher were reported in several regions of New York State (Foley *et al.* 1988), Ontario (Wren *et al.* 1986), and Manitoba (Kucera, 1983). Concentrations in excess of 20 µg/g occurred in Mink dying of methylmercury poisoning (Wobeser, 1973; Wobeser *et al.* 1976a, b). There may be other factors in addition to methylmercury concentration in the food supply of the mink and otter that are responsible for the association.

Another consideration is the combination effects of various contaminants on mammals. Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCB), DDT, dieldrin and mercury (Hg) are most often associated with the decline in Otter *Lutra lutra* populations in Europe (Norrgrén and Levengood, 2012). However it is possible that the PPCB/PCDD/PCDF congener profile is influencing toxicity in a way that is not accounted for. One complication of feeding mink diets containing fish collected from contaminated waters is that it is probable that other unaccounted contaminants are influencing the overall toxicity of the mixture. This may explain why Heaton *et al.* (1995) reported effects on kit survival and growth at dietary tPCB and TEQ concentrations that were 2.5-fold and 3.4-fold less, respectively, than the No Observed Averse Effect Level (NOAEL) reported by Bursian *et al.* (2006a). Similarly, Bursian *et al.* (2006b) reported that diets containing 3.7 µg tPCB/g feed or 50.4 pg TEQ/g feed provided by carp collected from the Housatonic River, Massachusetts, caused reduced kit survivability, resulting in a LOAEL that is 5.6 and 3 times greater than the LOAEL reported by Heaton *et al.* (1995) when expressed on a tPCB and TEQ basis, respectively. There have been a few mink studies conducted with single PCB, PCDD and PCDF congeners that avoid the complexities associated with exposure to a mixture of congeners as well as other contaminants. Hochstein and associates conducted studies that involved exposure of mink to TCDD. The first study (Hochstein *et al.*, 1988) established a 28-day LD50 of 4.2 µg TCDD/kg body weight. A 28-day LC50 of 4.8 ng TCDD/g feed and a 25-day LC50 of 0.85 ng TCDD/g feed was reported in the second study (Hochstein *et al.*, 1998). Beckett *et al.* (2008) reported that dietary concentrations of 24 and 2.4 ng 3,3',4,4',5-pentachlorobiphenyl (PCB 126)/g feed resulted in complete reproductive failure (2,400 and 240 pg TEQ/g feed, respectively), while a dietary concentration of 0.24 ng PCB 126/g feed (24 pg TEQ/g feed) was the NOAEL. Interestingly, Zwiernik *et al.* (2009) reported that an equivalent TEQ concentration (242 pg/g feed) provided by

2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzofuran (TCDF) had no effect on reproduction and survivability of offspring.

Kean *et al.* 2021 assessed spatial and temporal variation in organochlorine pesticides and PCBs in UK freshwaters, analysed tissues of Otter between 1992 and 2009. Past declines in otter populations have been linked to POPs and it is unclear whether otter recovery is hampered in any areas by their persistence. It is noted that PCBs, DDT (and derivatives), dieldrin and HCB were detected in over 80% of 755 otter livers sampled. Concentrations of PCBs and HCB in otters increased near the coast, potentially reflecting higher pollutant levels in estuarine systems. Decades after legislative controls, concentrations of these legacy pollutants still pose a risk to otters and other freshwater predators, with spatially widespread exceedance of thresholds above which reproduction or survival has been reduced in related species.

## **6. Conclusions**

Historically dioxin and mercury emissions from incinerators have been the cause of much public concern. However, the implementation of the EU Waste Incineration Directive 2000/76/EC and the Clean Air Act in the US has led to large reductions in incinerator emissions across the developed world. In Ireland dioxin levels are currently significantly less than applicable limits and are considered as low background levels in European terms.

Laboratory studies on birds and mammals have found an array of negative effects from dioxins and heavy metals. While a number of studies have attempted to replicate these effects in the wild, in areas which are heavily polluted, the results have been inconclusive. In one study, uptake of dioxins in the bird population resident near a waste incinerator were not increased in the ten years following the facility's opening. One complication of feeding animals diets containing fish collected from contaminated waters, appears to be that other unaccounted for contaminants can influence the overall toxicity of the mixture. While gaps in the research exist, between lab and field based studies, it does appear that the impact of polluted sediments on animals is complex. The complexities of examining individual and combination effects of dioxins, PCBs and heavy metals in the field seem, at present, to be beyond the reach of researchers. However, it does appear that the contribution of waste incineration to these pollutants has decreased significantly. In the years since strict legislation governing waste incineration has been implemented, mercury concentrations in bird feathers has dropped significantly alongside declines in mercury inputs from industrial sources.



## References

- Alloway, B.J. (ed.) (1995) Heavy metals in soils. (2nd Ed.) Blackie Academic & Professional: London.
- Andrew Power, Philip White, Brendan McHugh, Simon Berrow, Moira Schlingermann, Marissa Tannian, Stephen Newton, Evin McGovern, Sinéad Murphy, Denis Crowley, Linda O’Hea, Brian Boyle, Ian O’Connor, Persistent pollutants in Northern Gannet *Morus bassanus* eggs in Ireland: Levels and colony differences, Environmental Pollution, Volume 268, Part A, 2021,
- Barr, J. F. (1986). Population dynamics of the Common Loon (*Gavia immer*) associated with mercury-contaminated waters in northwestern Ontario. Occasional Paper No. 56, Canadian Wildlife Service, Ottawa.
- Beckett, K.J., Yamini, B. and Bursian, S.J. 2008. The effects of 3,3’,4,4’,5pentachlorobiphenyl (PCB 126) on mink (*Mustela vison*) reproduction and kit survivability and growth. In: Archives of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology, 54, pp. 123129.
- Birgit M. Braune, Mark L. Mallory, Declining trends of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, dibenzofurans and non-ortho PCBs in Canadian Arctic seabirds, Environmental Pollution, Volume 220, Part A, 2017,
- Blanco, Guillermo; Jimenez, Begona; Frias, Oscar; Millan, Javier; Davila, Jose A., 2004: Contamination with nonessential metals from a solid-waste incinerator correlates with nutritional and immunological stress in pre-fledgling black kites. Environmental Research. 94(1): 94-101
- Bontoux, L. 1999. The Incineration of Waste in Europe: Issues and Perspectives. European Commission Joint Research Centre.
- Bosveld, ATC, Gradener, J., Murk, AJ, Brouwer, A., Van Kampen, M. Evers, EHG and Van den Berg, M. 1995. Effects of PCDDs, PCDFs and PCBs in Common Tern (*Sterna hirundo*) breeding in estuarine and coastal colonies in the Netherlands and Belgium. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 14; 99-115
- Bowerman WW, Evans ED, Giesy JP, Postupalsky S. 1994. Using feathers to assess risk of mercury and selenium to Bald Eagle reproduction in the Great Lakes region. Arch Environ Contam Toxicol 27:294–298
- BREF (2006). Integrated Pollution Prevention and Control – Reference Document on the Best Available Techniques for Waste Incineration, European Commission.
- Buckley, J. Crowley, D., Keohane, C., Larkin, H., O’Farrell, K.J., Berry, D., Tlustos, C. and Sayers, R. 2013. Animal Health Surveillance of Dairy Herds in the Vicinity of Large Chemical Industrial Complex in the Cork Harbour Region 2005 – 2010. Cork County Council Report.
- Burger, J. and M. Gochfeld 1997. Risk, mercury levels, and birds: relating adverse laboratory effects to field bio-monitoring. Environ. Research 75: 160-172.
- Bursian, S.J., Beckett, K.J., Yamini, B., Martin, P.A., Kannan, K., Shields, K.L. and Mohr, F.C. 2006a. Assessment of effects in mink caused by consumption of carp collected from the Saginaw River, Michigan, USA. In: Archives of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology, 50, pp 614-623.
- Bursian, S.J., Sharma, C., Aulerich, R.J., Yamini, B., Mitchell, R.R., Orazio, C., Moore, D., Sivirski, S. and Tillitt, D.E. 2006b. Dietary exposure of mink (*Mustela vison*) to fish from the Housatonic River, Berkshire County, Massachusetts, USA: Effects on reproduction and kit growth and survival. In: Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry, 25, pp. 1533-1540

- Concannon, C. 2013. Dioxin Levels in the Irish Environment 2012. EPA report.
- Coutinho, M., Pereira, M., Silva, A., Ribeiro, C. and Borrega, C. 2012. Long-term monitoring of a waste to energy facility in Porto. In: IAIA Conference Proceedings: Energy Future, the role of impact assessment. The 32<sup>nd</sup> Annual Meeting of the International Association for the Impact Assessment, Porto, Portugal.
- de March et al (1998) Chapter 6: Persistent Organic Pollutants. in: AMAP Assessment Report: Arctic Pollution Issues. Arctic Monitoring and Assessment Programme (AMAP)
- Deriziotis, P., 2004. Substance and Perceptions of Environmental Impacts of Dioxin Emissions. M.S. Thesis, Columbia University (data by US EPA).
- Dvonch, J.T., Graney, J.R., Keeler, G.J., and Stevens, R.K. 1999, Use of elemental tracers to source apportion mercury in south Florida precipitation: Environmental Science Technology, 33; 4522-4527.
- EEA. (2023). Air pollutant emissions from large combustion plants in Europe. <https://www.eea.europa.eu>
- Eisler, R. 1985. Cadmium hazards to fish, wildlife and invertebrates a synoptic review: Biological report 85 (1,2). US Fish and Wildlife Service, Department of the Interior. Washington, D.C., USA
- Eisler, R. 1987. Mercury Hazards to Fish, Wildlife and Invertebrates: A Synoptic Review. US Fish and Wildlife Service Biological Report. 85
- EPA (2018). Air Quality in Ireland 2017-Indicators of Air Quality. Published by Environmental Protection Agency An Ghníomhaireacht um Chaomhnú Comhshaoil
- EPA (2021). Air Quality in Ireland (2021). Published by Environmental Protection Agency An Ghníomhaireacht um Chaomhnú Comhshaoil
- EU, 1999, Council Directive 1999/31/EC of 26 April 1999 on the landfill of waste (OJ L 182 16.7.1999, p. 1-19).
- EU, 2024, Regulation (EU) 2024/1244 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 24 April 2024 on reporting of environmental data from industrial installations, establishing an Industrial Emissions Portal and repealing Regulation (EC) No 166/2006 (OJ L, 2024/1244, 2.5.2024).
- European Commission 2006. Identification, assessment and prioritisation of EU measures to reduce releases of unintentionally produced/released Persistent Organic Pollutants. REFERENCE:O7.010401/2005/419391/MAR/D4
- European Environment Agency (EEA). (2019). European Union emission inventory report 1990–2017 under the UNECE Convention on Long-range Transboundary Air Pollution (LRTAP). EEA Report No 13/2019. <https://www.eea.europa.eu/publications/european-union-emission-inventory-report-2019>
- Eurostat, 2024, ‘Municipal waste statistics – Municipal waste treatment’ (Municipal waste statistics - Statistics Explained) accessed 11 September 2024.
- Findley, MT and Stendell, RC. 1978. Survival and reproductive success in Black Ducks fed mercury. Environ. Pollut. 16;51-54
- Findley, MT, Stickel, WH and Christensen, RE. 1979. Mercury residues in tissues of dead and surviving birds fed methylmercury. Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol, 21;105-110
- Foley, R.E., S.J. Jackling, R.J. Sloan and M.K. Brown. 1988. Organochlorine and mercury residues in wild Mink and Otter: Comparison with fish. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 7:363-374.

- Frederick PC, Spalding MG, Dusek R. 2002. Wading birds as bio-indicators of mercury contamination in Florida, USA: annual and geographic variation. *Toxicol Chem* 2002;21:163–7
- Frederick, PC. 2000. Mercury contamination and its effects on the Everglades ecosystem. *Reviews in Toxicology*, 3; 213-256
- German Ministry of Environment. 2005. Waste Incineration — A Potential Danger? The Contribution of Waste Management to sustainable development in Germany
- Gochfeld, M. (1971) Pre-mature feather loss---a "new disease" of Common Terns on Long Island, New York. *Kingbird* 21:206-211.
- Hammond, AL 1971. Mercury in the environment; natural and human factors. *Science* 171; 788-789
- Hart, L.E., K.M. Cheng, W.E. Whitehead, A.M. Shah, R.J. Lewis, S.R. Ruscjowski, R.W. Blair, D.C. Bennett, S.M. Bandiera, R.J. Norstrom and G.D. Bellward. 1991. Dioxin contamination and growth and development in Great Blue Heron embryos. *J. Toxicol. Environ. Health* 32:331-344.
- Hays, H. and R.W. Risebrough 1971. The early warning of the terns. *Natural History*
- Heaton, S.N., Bursian, S.J., Giesy, J.P., Tillitt, D.E., Render, J.A., Jones, P.D., Verbrugge, D.A., Kubiak, T.J. and Aulerich, R.J. 1995. Dietary exposure of mink to carp from Saginaw Bay, Michigan. I. Effects on reproduction and survival and the potential risks to wild mink populations. In: *Archives of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology*, 28, pp. 334-343.
- Herring G. 2008. Constraints of landscape level prey availability on the physiological condition and productivity of great egrets and white ibises. Dissertation, Florida Atlantic University, Boca Raton, FL, 2008.
- Hochstein, J.R., Bursian, S.J. and Aulerich, R.J. 1998. Effects of dietary exposure to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin in adult female mink (*Mustela vison*). In: *Archives of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology*, 35, pp. 348-353.
- [http://www.epa.gov/ncea/pdfs/dioxin/nas-review/External Web Site Icon](http://www.epa.gov/ncea/pdfs/dioxin/nas-review/External%20Web%20Site%20Icon.pdf). 3/15/13
- Kean, E. F. , Shore, R. F., Scholey, G., Strachan, R. and Chadwick, E. A. 2021. Persistent pollutants exceed toxic thresholds in a freshwater top predator decades after legislative control. *Environmental Pollution* 272 , 116415. 10.1016/j.envpol.2020.116415
- Keith A Grasman, Mandy Annis, Carly Eakin, Jeremy Moore, Lisa L Williams, Monitoring and assessment of population, reproductive, and health effects in colonial waterbirds breeding at contaminated Great Lakes sites in Michigan, *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, Volume 44, Issue 1, January 2025, Pages 77–91,
- Kucera, E. 1983. Mink and Otter as indicators of mercury in Manitoba waters. *Canad. J Zool.* 61:2250-2256.
- Lange T, D. Richard, and H. Royals. 2000. Long-term trends of mercury bioaccumulation in Florida's Largemouth Bass, Annual Meeting South Florida Mercury Science Program, Tarpon Springs FL.
- Langlois, C. and Langis, R. 1995 Presence of airborne contaminants in the wildlife of northern Québec. *Sci. Total Environ* 15;160-161; 391-402
- Larison, J.R., G.E. Likens, J.W. Fitzpatrick, and J.G. Crock. 2000. Cadmium toxicity among wildlife in the Colorado Rocky Mountains. *Nature* 406:181-183.
- Lepp, N.W. (Ed.) (1981) Effect of heavy metal pollution on plants-Volume 1: Effects of trace metals on plant function. Applied Science Publishers: London.
- Lindberg, P. and T. Odsjö. 1983. Mercury levels in feathers of Peregrine Falcon *Falco peregrinus* compared with total mercury content in some of its prey species in Sweden. *Environ. Pollut.* 5: 297-318.

- M.P. Hammond, S.R. de Solla, K.D. Hughes, M.E.B. Bohannon, K.G. Drouillard, G.C. Barrett, W.W. Bowerman, Legacy contaminant trends in the Great Lakes uncovered by the wildlife environmental quality index, *Environmental Pollution*, Volume 343, 2024,
- Ma, Yanju & Choi, Chi-Yeung & Thomas, Alex & Gibson, Luke. (2022). Review of contaminant levels and effects in shorebirds: Knowledge gaps and conservation priorities. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*. 242. 113868. 10.1016/j.ecoenv.2022.113868.
- Manahan, S. 2000. *Environmental Chemistry*, 7th edn, Lewis Publishers/CRC Press LLC, London, 2000.
- Masunaga, S., Nakanishi, J., 1999. Dioxin impurities in old Japanese agrochemical formulations. *Organohalogen Compd.* 41, 41–44.
- Masunaga, S., Takasuga, T., Nakanishi, J., 2001. Dioxin and dioxin-like PCB impurities in some Japanese agrochemical formulations. *Chemosphere* 44, 873–885.
- Millrath K., Roethel F.J., Kargbo D.V., 2004. Waste-to-energy residues – the search for beneficial uses. In: 12th North American Waste to Energy Conference (NAWTEC 12), Savannah, GA, May 17–19, pp. 1–812.
- Monteiro LR, Granadeiro JP, Furness RW, Oliveira P. 1999. Contemporary patterns of mercury contamination in the Portuguese Atlantic inferred from mercury concentrations in seabird tissues. *Mar Environ Res* 47: 137–156
- Naito, W. and Murato, M. 2009. Evaluation of population-level ecological risks of dioxinlike polychlorinated biphenyl exposure to fish-eating birds in Tokyo Bay and its vicinity. *Integrated Environmental Assessment and Management*, 3 (1); 68–78.
- Norrgren, L., and Levengood, J.M. 2012. *Ecology and Animal Health. Ecosystem Health and Sustainable Agriculture*. v. 2. Uppsala, Sweden: The Baltic University Programme, Uppsala University, 2012. 380 pp., ill.-380 pp., ill. pp.
- Nriagu, J.O. (Ed.) (1998) *Thallium in the environment*. *Advances in Environmental*
- Odsjö, T. 1975. Toxic chemicals in sedentary and migratory birds in Fennoscandia and Baltic sea areas. *Ornis. Fenn.* 52; 74-82.
- Ono, Kyoko (2013) Past and future cadmium emissions from municipal solid-waste incinerators in Japan for the assessment of cadmium control policy, *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, Volume 262, 2013, Pages 741-747, ISSN 0304-3894,
- Porteus, A. (1996) *Dictionary of environmental science and technology* (2nd Ed.). J Wiley: Chichester
- Psomopoulos, C.S.; Bourka, A.; Themelis, N.J. “Waste-to-Energy: A Review of the Status and Benefits in the USA, *Waste Management*; Vol. 29, January 2009; pp. 1718–1724.
- Quina, M.J, Bordado, J.C.M, and Quinta-Ferreira, R.M, 2011. *Air Pollution Control in Municipal Solid Waste Incinerators: The Impact of Air Pollution on Health, Economy, Environment and Agricultural Sources*, 1st ed., University Campus STeP Ri, Slavka Krautzeka 83/A, 51000 Rijeka, Croatia.
- Rappe, A. (1973) Influence de la pollution par le mercure sur les populations d'oiseaux. *L'Oiseau et R.F.O.* 43: 196-204.
- Rumbold DG, Bruner MC, Mihalik MB and Marti EA (1997) “Biomonitoring environmental contaminants near a municipal solid-waste combustor” *Environmental Pollution* 96(1) 99105.
- Rumbold, DG and Mihalik, MB (2002) Biomonitoring environmental contaminants near a municipal solid-waste combustor, a decade later. *Environmental Pollution* 117: 15-21
- Sarah E. Janssen, Michael T. Tate, Brett A. Poulin, David P. Krabbenhoft, John F. DeWild, Jacob M. Ogorek, Matthew S. Varonka, William H. Orem, Jeffrey L. Kline,

- Decadal trends of mercury cycling and bioaccumulation within Everglades National Park, Science of The Total Environment, Volume 838, Part 1, 2022,
- Scheuhammer AM, Meyer MW, Sandheinrich MB, Murray MW (2007) Effects of environmental methylmercury on the health of wild birds, mammals, and fish. *AMBIO: J Human Environ* 36:12–19
  - Scheuhammer, A. M. (1991). Effects of acidification on the availability of toxic metals and calcium to wild birds and mammals. *Environ. Pollut.*, 71, 329-375.
  - Science and
  - Senthilkumar K1, Iseki N, Hayama S, Nakanishi J, Masunaga S. (2002). Polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, dibenzofurans, and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls in livers of birds from Japan. *Arch Environ Contam Toxicol*. 2002 Feb;42(2):244-55.
  - Shane R. de Solla, D. V. Chip Weseloh, Kimberley D. Hughes, David J. Moore "Forty-Year Decline of Organic Contaminants in Eggs of Herring Gulls (*Larus argentatus*) from the Great Lakes, 1974 to 2013," *Waterbirds*, 39(sp1), 166-179, (1 April 2016)
  - Shun-I Shiha, I-Ching Wangbc, Kuen-Yuh Wud, Hsing-Wang Libc, Lin-Chi Wange & Guo-Ping Chang-Chiene. 2009. Uptake of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans in laying ducks *Journal of Environmental Science and Health, Part A: Toxic/Hazardous Substances and Environmental Engineering*, Volume 44, 8; 799-807
  - Sleeman J. M., Cristol, D. A., White, A. E., Evers, D. C., Gerhold, R. W. and Keel, M. K. 2010. Mercury poisoning in a freeliving northern river otter (*Lontra canadensis*). – *J. Wildl. Dis.* 46: 1035–1039
  - Spalding, M.G., P.C. Frederick, H.C. McGill, S.N. Bouton and L.R. McDowell (2000a) Methylmercury accumulation in tissues and its effects on growth and appetite in captive Great Egrets, *J. Wildlife Diseases* 36:411-422.
  - Spalding, M.G., P.C. Frederick, H.C. McGill, S.N. Bouton, L.J. Richey, I.M. Schumacher, C.G.M. Blackmore and J. Harrison (2000b) Histologic, neurologic, and immunologic effects of methylmercury in captive Great Egrets, *J. Wildlife Diseases* 36:423-435.
  - Sundlof, S.F., M.G. Spalding, J.D. Wentworth and C.K. Steible, 1994. Mercury in livers of wading birds (*Ciconiiformes*) in Southern Florida. *Environ. Contam. Toxicol.*, 27: 299-305.
  - Themelis, N.J., Gregory, A., 2002. Mercury Emissions from high temperature sources in the NY/NJ Hudson Raritan Basin. In: *Proceeding of NAWTEC 11. American Society of Mechanical Engineers*, pp. 205–215.
  - Thompson DR, Furness RW (1989) Comparison of total and organic mercury in seabird feathers. *Mar Pollut Bull* 20. 577-5
  - Thompson, D. R., R. W. Furness, and L. R. Monteiro. 1998. Seabirds as bio-monitors of mercury inputs to epipelagic and mesopelagic marine food chains. *Science of the Total Environment* 213:299–305
  - Toweill, D.E. and J.E. Tabor. 1982. River otter. In: *Wild Mammals of North America*, J.A. Chapman and G.A. Feldhamer, Ed. Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, MD. p. 688-703.
  - U.S. EPA 1997. Mercury Study Report to Congress c7o032-1-1 Office of Air Quality Planning & Standards and Office of Research and Development Volume VII:
  - United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), 1999. Dioxin and furan inventories. *UNEP Chemicals*, pp. 82–87.
  - United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S.EPA). Exposure and Human Health Reassessment of 2,3,7,8-Tetrachlorodibenzo-p-Dioxin (TCDD) and Related Compounds National Academy Sciences (NAS) Review Draft. 2004. Available at URL:

- US Environmental Protection Agency, Letter to President of Integrated Waste Services Association, February 2003. <[www.wte.org/docs/epaletter.pdf](http://www.wte.org/docs/epaletter.pdf)>.
- Vernet, J.P. (1992) Trace metals in the environment 2: Impact of heavy metals on the environment. Elsevier: Amsterdam.
- Wobeser, G., N.D. Nielsen and B. Schiefer. 1976a. Great Lakes Water Quality Initiative
- Wobeser, G., N.D. Nielsen and B. Schiefer. 1976b. Mercury and mink II: Experimental methylmercury intoxication. *Can. J. Comp. Med.* 40:34-45.
- Wolfe, M.F., Schwarzbach, S., Sulaiman, R.A., 1998. Effects of mercury on wildlife: a comprehensive review. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry* 17, 146-160
- Wren, C.D. 1985. Probable case of mercury poisoning in a wild otter in northwestern Ontario. *Can. Field-Nat.* 99:112-114.
- Wren, C.D., P.M. Stokes and K.L. Fischer. 1986. Mercury levels in Ontario mink and otter relative to food levels and environmental acidification. *Canad. J Zool.* 64:2854-2859.
- Yoshida, H., Kazuaki Takahashi, Nobuo Takeda, Shin-ichi Sakai. 2009. Japan's waste management policies for dioxins and polychlorinated biphenyls. *Journal of Mater. Cycles Waste Management* 11: 229-243
- Zwiernik MJ, Kay DP, Moore JN, Beckett KJ, Newsted JL, Roark S, Giesy JP. 2008. Exposure and effects assessment of resident mink exposed to polychlorinated dibenzofurans and other dioxin-like compounds in the Tittabawassee River Basin, Midland, MI, USA on wild mink (*Mustela vison*). *Environ Toxicol Chem.* 27:2076–2087.
- Zwiernik, M.J., Beckett, K.J., Bursian, S., Kay, D.P., Holem, R.R., Moore, J.N., Yamini, B. and Giesy, J.P. 2009. Chronic effects of polychlorinated dibenzofurans on mink in laboratory and field conditions. In: *Integrated Environmental Assessment and Management*, 105, 291-301.